3. Criteria for Merit Increases, Promotion, and Granting of Tenure[19]

"Faculty status entails for librarians the same rights and responsibilities as for other members of the faculty. They should have corresponding entitlement to rank, promotion, tenure, compensation, leaves, and research funds. They must go through the same process of evaluation and meet the same standards as other faculty members." (*Joint Statement on Faculty Status of College and University Librarians*, ACRL, 1972)

The WSU Faculty review process is outlined in the *WSU Faculty Manual*. General guidelines for criteria used in evaluating library faculty are listed in III.D.3.b.3. Those general criteria are supplemented by the specific criteria listed below, which are supplemental to the *WSU Faculty Manual*, the governing document for faculty review.[20]

---

[20] See *WSU Faculty Manual*, Section III.D.4.c "Advancement in Rank."

The granting of merit increases, promotion and tenure should be based on the judgments of Library faculty, members of the University faculty outside the Library, and, in the cases of tenure and promotion, professional colleagues outside WSU. Library faculty will be evaluated on performance according to criteria in the following three categories:

CATEGORY I: PROFESSIONAL COMPETENCE AS A LIBRARIAN

CATEGORY II: RESEARCH/SCHOLARLY/CREATIVE & PROFESSIONAL ACHIEVEMENTS AND ACTIVITIES

CATEGORY III: SERVICE TO THE LIBRARY, UNIVERSITY, AND THE PUBLIC

For annual review, tenure and promotion, and promotion, Library faculty are evaluated according to the following formula:

Category I = 70%
Category II = 20%
Category III = 10%

Library faculty must meet expectations in all three categories; achievement in one category cannot substitute for inadequacies in the other categories. Demonstrated merit and evidence of developing excellence are essential for increases in salary, advances in rank, and the granting of tenure.

Application of the criteria in each of the three categories will vary depending on individual assignment(s). Many librarians must manage units as part of their primary responsibilities. Management effectiveness is critical to the provision of Library services; thus it is included in the Category I criteria. In addition, top Library administrators will be evaluated on their administrative effectiveness as part of the considerations for the granting of salary increases, promotion, and tenure.

The *WSU Faculty Manual* states: "Tenure is granted only for academic rank of professional status within programs, departments, or service units. Department Chairs, School Directors, Deans, Directors, and other administrative officers do not acquire tenure in administrative positions."[21]

CATEGORY I: PROFESSIONAL COMPETENCE AS A LIBRARIAN (70%)
Each librarian must demonstrate competence and evidence of developing excellence in his/her primary area(s) of responsibility, and maintain cooperative relations with faculty and staff. The following are examples of specific criteria for each area of responsibility:

a. Direct Reference Services
Demonstrates competence and good judgment in assisting all Library users to locate

---

[21] *WSU Faculty Manual,* III.D.5.a "General."

information.
1. Correctly discerns and interprets user requests and questions.
2. Demonstrates competence in using reference materials and other resources.
3. Demonstrates expertise in appropriate academic subject areas.
4. Maintains positive working relationships with personnel in academic departments or programs.
5. Demonstrates a willingness to assist users, persisting beyond conventional sources to provide desired information.
6. Demonstrates sensitivity to and understanding of users' needs.
7. Effectively communicates knowledge of library organization, policy and goals to users and academic departments.
8. Demonstrates understanding of acquisitions, bibliographic organization and control.

b. Collection Development

Demonstrates good professional judgment, fiscal responsibility, and competence in selecting library materials, in whatever format is appropriate including electronic, in support of the current needs and long-range goals of the Libraries. Demonstrates knowledge of licensing procedures and restrictions appropriate to the librarian's responsibilities.
1. Demonstrates comprehensive knowledge of the library collection, particularly in assigned academic subject areas.
2. Demonstrates knowledge of the curriculum, research, and other library-related activities of the University departments represented within an individual's assigned academic subject areas.
3. Demonstrates competence and good judgment in selecting and deselecting materials in all formats, both in assigned subject areas and interdisciplinary fields.
4. Maintains positive working relationships with personnel in academic departments or programs in assigned subject areas.

c.   Instruction in Library Use

Demonstrates competence in instructing users on the effective use of library resources.
1. Uses knowledge of representative literature and current trends in the subject areas of an individual's library division during instructional sessions.
2. Instructs users on accessing specialty resource collections within the WSU Libraries and on relevant external collections.
3. Effectively communicates knowledge of applicable resources within appropriate academic subject areas.
4. Develops effective instructional materials relevant to the needs of the individuals and groups served.
5. Demonstrates competence in the presentation of instructional sessions to the individuals and groups served by the Library.
6. Demonstrates knowledge of research strategies and the teaching of research skills.

d.   Bibliographic Organization and Control

Demonstrates competence in establishing and maintaining bibliographic systems that facilitate the organization and control of library resources.

1. Demonstrates in-depth knowledge of past and present cataloging rules.
2. Competently applies currently accepted cataloging rules to produce high quality cataloging for all types of materials.
3. Demonstrates comprehensive knowledge of classification tables and subject heading schedules.
4. Demonstrates knowledge in the creation and application of metadata to facilitate effective access to digital information.
5. Demonstrates competence in the use of automated library systems and knowledge of current developments.
6. Demonstrates sensitivity to the needs of library users.

e. Acquisition of Library/Media Resources

Demonstrates competence in establishing and maintaining procedures for the effective and economical acquisition of library or media resources.
1. Demonstrates in-depth knowledge of the book or media trade and other sources of library/media materials.
2. Demonstrates competence in ordering, receiving and paying for library/media materials.
3. Demonstrates understanding of bibliographic citation techniques and descriptive cataloging.
4. Demonstrates competence in the use of automated systems and knowledge of current developments.
5. Demonstrates sensitivity to the needs of library users.
6. Successfully monitors budgetary expenditures and reports the results.

f. Access Services

Demonstrates competence in establishing and maintaining procedures designed to facilitate user access to WSU library collections and resources, and to the collections and resources made available through agreements with other colleges, universities, organizations, and institutions.
1. Demonstrates in-depth knowledge of automated circulation, reserves, and/or interlibrary loan systems.
2. Demonstrates understanding of agreements governing resource sharing among WSU campuses and programs, between WSU and relevant library consortia, and between WSU and providers of Direct Document Delivery services.
3. Demonstrates competence in managing and fulfilling requests for material through circulation, interlibrary loan, and/or document delivery services.
4. Demonstrates understanding of copyright law and licensing agreements as related to access services.
5. Demonstrates understanding of services available to distance users.
6. Demonstrates ability to generate statistical analyses of access services and to communicate relevant information to appropriate units and individuals within the Libraries.
7. Demonstrates competence in space/stacks planning and management.
8. Demonstrates sensitivity to the needs of library users.
9. Demonstrates competence in monitoring financial transactions (e.g., fees, fines, transaction charges) and providing budgetary accountability through appropriate reports.

g.   Automated Systems Activities

Demonstrates competence in the use, evaluation and/or development of automated systems which support the principal activities and services of the Libraries, including mainframe as well as microcomputer-based applications.

1. Demonstrates understanding of existing system capabilities as well as general knowledge of current developments in library automation.
2. Designs effective and efficient means of evaluating library systems and provides appropriate analyses of such evaluation.
3. Demonstrates effectiveness in undertaking needs analyses, preparing specifications and assisting in the design, testing, and implementation of enhancements to the Libraries' automated systems.
4. Effectively communicates knowledge of library automated systems activity to staff in the Libraries and to other appropriate departments and individuals within the University.
5. Maintains positive working relationships with Information Technology (IT) personnel as well as with staff in other library units.
6. Willingly assist, when appropriate, in the instruction of library staff in automated systems activities and procedures.

h.   Management Effectiveness

Demonstrates good judgment and competence in directing and guiding library employees. Some criteria apply only to librarians who supervise library staff, while others also apply to those who have a coordination function without supervisory responsibilities. These criteria will apply to managers who are not unit heads.

1. Establishes and achieves goals and objectives in area of responsibility.
2. Maintains constructive working environment for employees.
3. Effectively plans and coordinates resources within budgetary constraints.
4. Competently monitors and directs the performance of employees supervised.
5. Delegates authority when appropriate or necessary.
6. Communicates effectively with supervised employees and other personnel in the libraries.
7. Effectively represents the libraries to the rest of the university and promotes ongoing efforts for cooperation and collaboration.
8. Assists in the selection of competent, well-qualified employees in area of responsibility.
9. Impartially evaluates the performance of supervised employees.

i.   Administrative Effectiveness

"Since the Senior Administrators of the WSU Libraries make recommendations that affect library faculty and staff system-wide and that affect the relationship of the WSU Libraries to the WSU community, comments from all library personnel will be solicited by the Dean of Libraries during the annual review process. Where appropriate, individuals outside the WSU Libraries will also be invited to comment on the performance of an administrator."[22]
These criteria are applicable only to the following positions:

---

[22] This paragraph was approved at the 3/25/96 Library Faculty Meeting to replace the 4-year administrative review procedure that was instituted by the Library Faculty in 6/92.

> • *Dean of Libraries*
> • *Associate or Assistant Deans*
> • *Unit Heads*

1. Represents users' interests and needs in setting library goals and objectives.
   a. Periodically assesses users' needs.
   b. Demonstrates competence in analyzing, planning and creating effective library services.

2. Provides effective leadership in the following areas:
   a. Formation and achievement of library goals and objectives
   b. Formation and execution of library policies and procedures
   c. Coordination and management of unit resources
   d. Development of innovative procedures, operations and/or services
   e. Representation of the Library to the university administration and the public.

3. Demonstrates good judgment in the preparation of budget requests and justifications for unit resources:
   a. Solicits extramural funding for special library projects.
   b. Successfully monitors budgetary expenditures and reports the results.

4. Demonstrates competence in personnel administration.
   a. Provides a congenial working environment for colleagues and staff.
   b. Supports and encourages collegial participation.
   c. Effectively promotes the image of librarians within the university community.
   d. Provides opportunities for professional growth and staff development.
   e. Motivates staff to perform effectively and efficiently.
   f. Impartially evaluates the achievements and performance of library personnel according to established criteria

5. Demonstrates effectiveness in communication and interpersonal relations.
   a. Competently communicates with library and university personnel.
   b. Demonstrates a commitment to the dissemination of information within the university community.

CATEGORY II: RESEARCH/SCHOLARLY/CREATIVE & PROFESSIONAL ACHIEVEMENTS AND ACTIVITIES (20%)

Since "the everyday professional activities of librarians [may] bring them into contact with the entire realm of knowledge,"[23] research/scholarly/creative and professional activities in any area will be supported by the Libraries and will be given credit in assignment of merit ratings and promotion and tenure decisions.[24]

---

[23] Geahigan, P. et al, "Acceptability of Non-Library/Information Science Publications in the Promotion and Tenure of Academic Librarians," *College & Research Libraries*, Nov. 1981: 571-575.
[24] See "Guidelines for Professional Activity Time (PAT)" below.

Research/scholarly/creative and professional contributions will be evaluated for quality, quantity, and professional significance. Credit in the form of increased merit rating should be awarded at the time of publication, funding, exhibition, or performance. The following activities are examples and are not listed in priority order.   In support of the changing landscape of scholarly communications, we encourage library faculty to publish in open access journals or to deposit into a repository, when appropriate.

a.   Formal Publications (in any format)
   1. Publication of a monograph or book.
   2. Publication of articles in refereed journals.
   3. Publication of articles in non-refereed journals.
   4. Contribution of a chapter or an article in a monograph or book.
   5. Publication of substantial bibliographies.
   6. Editing, compiling or indexing any substantial published work.
   7. Reviews of books, media, websites, and other resources.

b. Presentations
   1. Presentations at meetings, conferences, or workshops.
   2. Presentations to local groups.
   3. Giving workshops.
   4. Presentation of research/scholarly/creative exhibits/programs.

c. Professional Activities
   1. Active membership in international, national, regional, state, and/or local professional organizations. *(Active membership means holding office, chairing or being a member of active committees, presenting papers at symposia, conferences, annual meetings, conducting workshops, etc.).*
   2. Service as moderator or panelist at international or national conventions.
   3. Service as moderator or panelist at regional or state conventions.
   4. Service as organizer of professional meetings.
   5. Service as editor of an academic or professional publication or journal.
   6. Service as referee to a professional and/or scholarly journal.
   7. Book and audio-visual material reviewing and/or abstracting.
   8. Professional consulting or advisory services outside the university.[25]
   9. Substantial contributions to educational, scientific, cultural, civic organizations and/or private or governmental agencies at community, state, regional, national, or international levels.
   10. Demonstration of ability to procure funding, grants, or donor gifts.
   11. Recognitions and outstanding achievements (awards, honor societies, etc.).

d. Continuing Education

---

[25] *WSU Faculty Manual*, IV.D "Policy on Compensated Outside Service by Faculty Members—Consulting."

1. Completion of an additional advanced degree.
2. Coursework undertaken to expand professional competence.
3. Attendance at professional or scholarly seminars, workshops, or meetings.

CATEGORY III: SERVICE TO THE LIBRARY, UNIVERSITY, AND THE PUBLIC (10%)

Professional service efforts may be at the local, state, regional, national, or international level. The following activities are examples and will be evaluated on a qualitative and quantitative basis.

a. **Library Service**
  1. Active participation on library working groups, committees and task forces.
  2. Service as a representative of the library to professional or governmental bodies or agencies.
  3. Service as editor or contributor to in-house publications.
  4. Preparation of exhibits or programs within the Libraries.

b. **University Service**
  1. Active participation on university and university-related committees and task forces.
  2. Participation in university governance (Senate officer, Senator, etc.).
  3. Presentations or seminars to, or consultations with, faculty and student groups within the university relating to professional matters.
  4. Service as an advisor to student groups recognized by the university.
  5. Service as a representative of the university to professional or governmental bodies or agencies.
  6. Consulting or advisory service to WSU off-campus programs or research/extension stations.
  7. Preparation of exhibits or programs within the university.

c. **Service to the Public**
  1. Presentation of informational public lectures or addresses.
  2. Service to community libraries, museums or historical societies.

4. Models for Library Faculty Promotion and Tenure[26]

The purpose in developing models for Library Faculty promotion and tenure is to give librarians additional information regarding what is needed to achieve tenure. This document is intended to be a supplement to the Tenure Criteria found in the *Library Faculty Handbook*. It must be remembered that while quality is the driving factor in tenure decisions, quantity also contributes to successful tenure consideration. The intention of the criteria and procedures is to maintain a

---

[26] Approved at the 5/15/00 Library Faculty Meeting. A third model that was an option for promotion to Librarian 3 and Librarian 4, the Professional Participation Model, was eliminated at the 12/13/2012 Library Faculty Meeting.

reasonable balance between equity and due process for the candidate and the promotion of excellence in the Libraries.

Individualism and diversity are valued in tenure consideration, hence the importance of more than one model as a path to tenure; each librarian selects the model best suited to him or herself, and indicates this model in documents supporting pre-tenure and tenure evaluation.

Models 1 and 2 relate to tenure and promotion to Librarian 3. Model 3 is for promotion to Librarian 4.

> **a. Model 1 - The Balanced Model: A balance of achievement in primary responsibilities, publication and professional participation, and service is in evidence, according to the Library faculty designation of 70% effort in Category 1, 20% in Category 2 and 10% in Category 3.**

Category I   (Professional Competence as a Librarian) - Strong performance in primary job assignment is essential for positive consideration for tenure and promotion. Annual reviews point up any problem areas that need to receive attention and emphasis. Steady improvement and growth is expected. Examples of this growth would be higher levels of performance, increased sophistication in projects and responsibilities, and leadership activities.

Category II   (Research/Scholarly/Creative & Professional Achievement and Activities) - Publication usually includes two or more substantial writings such as an article in a refereed journal or a book chapter. Other publications such as reviews of books, media, websites, and other resources and less substantial articles in terms of audience or length are exhibited during the course of the candidate's time at WSU Libraries. Professional activity includes a record of membership, active participation, and/or leadership in substantial committees of regional, national or international library organizations and/or of scholarly organizations in other disciplines. Regional, national or international organization committees, including discussion groups, where a great deal of work is entailed and the candidate has been a fully participating member or chair are given more weight. Of particular note are activities that entail a great deal of time and energy and/or that produce substantive work that is important to the development of the organization and/or the profession.

It is the responsibility of the tenure candidate to document the importance of the organization and the person's contribution to that organization.

Category III (Service to the Library, University, and the Public) - Service on Library committees, University committees and to the community is steady over the candidate's years at WSU. Committees that meet often, call for major time commitments, and are important to the mission, governance, and/or structure of the Library and University are more heavily weighted. Community service includes any volunteer activity that benefits the entire community or segments thereof.

> **b. Model 2 - The Publication Model: The candidate has chosen to be more involved in publication and less involved in organization work. Category 2 is still evaluated overall as 20% of effort.**

Category I - Same as Model 1. 70%

Category II - A strong and consistent pattern of publication should be evident. Typically, a committed publication record includes a major contribution to the field, such as a scholarly monograph, or a minimum of five articles in refereed journals, or the equivalent. Since the emphasis is on publication, there will be a rigorous review of quality, creativity, originality and quantity. Measures by which research and creative activities may be evaluated include annual written evaluations; copies of publications, papers, and grant applications; published reviews; letters of evaluation from professional associates; and honors or awards received. Some professional activity in organizations must be evidenced.

Category III - Same as Model 1. 10%

c. Model 3 - Promotion to Librarian 4

The Libraries guidelines for promotion to the highest librarian rank, Librarian 4, include achievement of specific criteria for the promotion to Librarian 3, but in each instance more is expected, i.e., high performance as a librarian, more significant publications, and evidence of a national or international reputation. As stated in the *WSU Faculty Manual*, "Attainment of the rank of Professor is an indication that, in the opinion of colleagues, an individual has made, and continues to make, outstanding contributions to a major area of the individual's work assignment. Satisfaction of minimum criteria at the unit level is not sufficient to ensure promotion. In fact, some successful faculty members will complete their careers without being promoted to the rank of Professor."[27] Libraries faculty who are promoted to Librarian 4 have a distinguished record of research and professional activities in addition to excellence in the practice of librarianship.

Model 1 - The Balanced Model: A balance of achievement in primary responsibilities, publication and professional participation, and service is in evidence.

Category 1 - Strong performance in primary job assignment is mandatory for promotion to Librarian 4, with a demonstrated record of progressive growth and excellence in librarianship. High supervisory evaluations, significant levels of performance, favorable assessments by colleagues and other pertinent individuals, major projects and responsibilities, leadership activities, and awards are indicators of achievement.

Category 2 - Excellence in research, scholarly, and professional performance includes a demonstrated regional, national or international impact on librarianship and favorable comparison to others at a similar stage in their professional careers. Original scholarship or creative productivity is evident through electronic or print publications, reports to professional organizations, presentations, exhibits, awards, or similar accomplishments. A consistent pattern of publication and participation should be evident. Typically, a publication record includes a

---

[27] III.4.c "Promotion to Professor."

major contribution to the field, such as a scholarly monograph, or usually at least four articles in refereed journals, or the equivalent. Measures by which research and creative activities may be evaluated include annual written evaluations; copies of publications, papers, and grant applications; published reviews; letters of evaluation from professional associates; and honors or awards received. Measures by which professional activities may be evaluated include holding offices in regional, national or international professional organizations; presenting papers at regional, national or international conferences; and substantive participation in regional, national or international associations.

Category 3 - Commendable service on Library committees, University committees, and in community activities is steady over the years of employment. Measures by which service and outreach activities may be evaluated include, but are not limited to, annual supervisory evaluations, assessments by colleagues and other individuals who have observed the candidate's performance, and receipt of honors and awards.

Model 2: The Publication Model

Category 1 – Same as Model 1

Category 2 – A strong and consistent pattern of publication should be evident. Typically, a committed publication record includes a major contribution to the field, such as a scholarly monograph, or a minimum of five articles in refereed journals, or the equivalent. Since the emphasis is on publication, there will be a rigorous review of quality, creativity, originality and quantity. Measures by which research and creative activities are evaluated may include annual written evaluations; copies of publications, papers, and grant applications; published reviews; letters of evaluation from professional associates; and honors or awards received. Some professional activity in organizations must be evidenced.

Category 3 – Same as Model 1